

### **Annex 3: Consultation Comments and Officer Responses**

1. The consultation included the following elements:

- Distribution of a leaflet to all households in the Skelton, Clifton Without and Rawcliffe Ward area.
- Displays at Clifton Library, 9 St. Leonard's Place and Rawcliffe Bar Park & Ride site.
- A staffed exhibition at the Rawcliffe Bar Park & Ride site on 10 December (9:00 to 20:00)
- Attendance at the Rawcliffe Parish Council Meeting on 14 December
- Erection of road signs on the approaches to the roundabout.
- City of York Council Website
- Creation of an A19 Roundabout email address
- Press Release
- Internal Consultation with Council departments
- External Consultation with interest groups and the Emergency services

2. The following responses were received:

<b>Source</b>	<b>Number</b>
Email	93
Clifton Library Display	4
9, St Leonards Place Display	3
Rawcliffe Bar P&R Display	4
Rawcliffe Bar Exhibition	4 (22 attendees)
Letters	7
Telephone Calls	4

3. The responses included over 270 comments with approximately 30 unique items. A more detailed list of comments and officer responses is included in the following paragraphs. The items in order of number of times raised are listed in the following table.

## Summary of Comments

General Comment	Number Of Comments	Rank
Congestion in area is caused by A59 roundabout	26	<b>1</b>
Concerns about merging traffic on A1237	24	<b>2</b>
Concerns about driver behaviour on the roundabout	24	<b>2</b>
Supportive of scheme	23	<b>4</b>
Other sections of A1237 should be upgraded	18	<b>5</b>
Traffic signals would improve capacity/safety	18	<b>5</b>
The A1237 needs to be dual carriageway	16	<b>7</b>
Proposal not considered to be value for money	15	<b>8</b>
Segregated Left Turn Lane would improve capacity	14	<b>9</b>
Pedestrian/cycling issues	13	<b>10</b>
Concerns about congestion on the A19 Northbound out of City	12	<b>11</b>
Concerns about affect on landscaped embankment	11	<b>12</b>
Concerns that the scheme will not reduce journey times in the area	11	<b>12</b>
Concerns about closure of westbound Lay-by	10	<b>14</b>
Concerns about traffic speeds on roundabout	9	<b>15</b>
Concerns about queue lengths since previous upgrade	4	<b>16</b>
Concerns about level of lighting proposed	3	<b>17</b>
Questioned value of existing underpass & use by peds/cyclists	3	<b>17</b>
Concerns over access to Ings Cottages/House	3	<b>17</b>
Flyovers are needed	2	<b>20</b>
Concerns about access/ exit to Rawcliffe Bar P&R	2	<b>20</b>
Should spend money on alternative modes of transport	2	<b>20</b>
Problems exiting Manor Lane will be worse	2	<b>20</b>
Misc. Comments (Raised by single resident - 14 items)	14	<b>24</b>

### Congestion in the area is caused by the A59 Roundabout

- The highest ranked comment received was the view that the main cause of the delays in the area is queuing across the A19 roundabout in the westbound direction caused by the lack of capacity at the A59 junction.

#### Officer Response

- One of the main causes of journey delays on the north west section of the ring road is lack of capacity at both the A19 and A59 roundabouts. For the full benefit of the A19 upgrade scheme to be achieved improvements at the A59 roundabout are also required.
- In the morning peak period the A19 junction is not generally affected by the capacity of the A59 therefore significant journey time savings are expected when the A19 roundabout is improved in isolation. However

eastbound traffic is constrained by the capacity of the A19 roundabout and queues can extend as far as the A59 at peak times (particularly Saturday mornings/early afternoons). The proposed improvements to the A19 roundabout will significantly reduce this queuing and reduce the eastbound and westbound journey times.

7. In the evening peak period queues from the A59 roundabout extend over the Millfield Lane and A19 roundabouts restricting the capacity of these junctions. This queuing will restrict the benefits which could be achieved from the proposed A19 roundabout upgrade. The council proposes to upgrade the A59 roundabout as part of the Access York Phase 1 (Park & Ride) scheme with the delivery of this scheme subject to the approval of the Department for Transport (DfT). If approval is granted in the next few months it is anticipated that the A59 roundabout will be upgraded in 2011/12. Full consultation with local residents and users of the roundabout will be undertaken on the A59 scheme before the design is finalised once the funding has been confirmed by the DfT. If the A59 was upgraded before the A19 the full benefit of the A59 scheme would not be realised because of queuing from the A19 roundabout.
8. It is not anticipated that significant improvements to the journey times of traffic leaving the city in the evening will be achieved without the A59 being upgraded as well.

#### Concerns about merging traffic on A1237

9. Many responses raised concerns that the proposed two lane exit reducing down to a single lane will lead to additional accidents in the area.

#### Officer Response

10. The twin lane approaches and exits are a fundamental element of the scheme to achieve the desired increased capacity for the A1237. Turning movements at the roundabout indicate that approximately 70% of traffic approaching the junction on the A1237 at peak times (am & pm) travels straight across. It is anticipated that reduced queuing and journey times will not be achieved without providing additional straight ahead capacity.
11. The twin lane exits from the roundabout proposed are based upon the principle that traffic on the roundabout will be travelling at 30mph or less (standard roundabout design practice and supported by surveys of existing traffic at off peak times) and upon leaving the circulatory carriageway will have sufficient time to merge in a safe manner prior to the carriageway narrowing. The arrangement is broadly in line with the design standard for wide single carriageway 2+1 Roads (TD70) amended for the low speed and single carriageway nature of the roads under consideration. The proposed layout moves the merge point away from the roundabout and allows drivers to clear the junction area prior to

reducing to a single stream of traffic. The lengths allowed in the design take account of expected traffic speeds.

12. The layout is similar to the exit onto the A1237 recently constructed at the Hopgrove roundabout but provides a wider hatched central strip between the lanes rather than double white lines. It is proposed to provide additional signage to indicate that traffic should merge in turn and the lighting provision will be extended to the end of the widened carriageway.

#### Concerns about driver behaviour on the roundabout

13. Many respondents commented on the general poor lane discipline on the roundabout and the use of the incorrect approach lane to avoid queues. The concern is that this leads to conflict with other road users increasing the possibility of accidents and reduces the capacity of the junction.

#### Officers Response

14. Although behaviour of some drivers at the roundabout is frustrating the lane markings are advisory and it is difficult for the police to enforce the offence of inconsiderate driving. Lane markings have been adjusted in the past on the A1237 approaches which has reduced misuse at the roundabout but it is recognised that the practice still persists.
15. It is anticipated that the increased capacity at the roundabout will reduce the incentive for drivers to use the incorrect lane. The left turn lanes generate from the ahead lanes close to the roundabout giving little opportunity to make inappropriate use. The increased capacity by having two lanes on, through and off the roundabout for the ahead movement will reduce the opportunity for vehicles to cut in to these lanes.
16. Further design work has been undertaken to develop a layout that will encourage drivers to use the roundabout in accordance with the lane markings. The proposed measures include the provision of:
  - Pedestrian islands on all 3 lane approaches (A1237 (E&W) and A19 N). The islands and markings will be extended so that they operate as subsidiary deflection islands to deter drivers in the left turn lanes from excessive speeds and wilful use of incorrect lanes.
  - Additional lead in lanes across the circulatory markings to ensure that traffic is directed to the correct lane on the roundabout.
  - A CCTV camera to monitor traffic flows in the area.
  - Spiral lane markings on the circulatory carriageway reducing the need for lane changes on the roundabout.

Other sections of A1237 should be upgraded/ The A1237 needs to be dual carriageway

17. A number of comments were received suggesting that other sections of the A1237 have higher priority or that the route should be dual carriageway.

Officers Response

18. The council have undertaken a number of studies into the operation of the A1237 Outer Ring Road which has identified the highest priority junctions for improvement. The latest study was reported to the Executive on 23 September 2008.
19. The Hopgrove roundabout before the recent upgrade had the highest delays on the entire route. The current section with the longest delays is in the A19 to A59 area due to longer distance traffic using the river and railway crossings mixing with the local distribution traffic. Improvements to this section are planned to be delivered through the proposed A19 project, which is the subject of this report, as part of the Access York Phase 1 project and are also linked to the York Northwest development. The next highest delays are experienced at the Haxby Road roundabout. Outline design work is currently being undertaken to establish a more detailed cost to upgrade the Haxby Road roundabout.
20. The studies have shown that for affordability, value for money and environmental impact reasons improving the existing roundabouts is considered to be the most appropriate way forward. It is anticipated that dualling would reduce journey times on the ring road more than just improvements at the roundabouts but the cost is substantially higher principally because of the number of bridges required between the A59 and A19. The estimated cost for improvements to all roundabouts between Wetherby Road and Strensall Road (inclusive) and dualling between Wetherby Road and Clifton Moor is £62m (value for money assessed as medium). The equivalent cost for improvements to roundabouts only is £37m (value for money assessed as good). For comparison the annual Integrated Transport budget for the City is approximately £3m. A bid to the Regional Transport Board for funding for the upgrade of all of the roundabouts was submitted in October 2008 however due to pressure on the budget from other regional schemes it was classified as a reserve scheme to be progressed only if other schemes across the region were delayed.
21. The proposed improvements at the A19 roundabout are not incompatible with the introduction of a dual carriageway at a future date.
22. An upgrade scheme for the Outer Ring Road which included flyovers has also been investigated by the council and would provide significant journey time savings however the value for money would be low, the cost prohibitive and the environmental impact considerable – particularly at the A59 junction. A scheme which included flyovers to all roundabouts

between the A59 and A19 and improvements to all other roundabouts at ground level and dual carriageway between Wetherby Road and Haxby Road would cost £133m (value for money assessed as low). A full end to end (Copmanthorpe to Hopgrove) dual carriageway with flyovers would cost approximately £265m (value for money assessed as very poor). It is considered unlikely that a bid for funding to progress a flyover based scheme would be successful if it represents low or poor value for money when assessed using DfT criteria.

23. The proposed A19 roundabout improvements are unlikely to be fully compatible with any future grade separated solution as the layout would need to substantially changed to accommodate slip roads and structures.

#### Traffic signals would improve capacity/safety

24. Many comments included the suggestion that traffic signals would improve the capacity and safety of the junction. One resident requested that traffic signals should not be provided.

#### Officers Response

25. It is considered that the existing roundabout is not large enough to be signalised and maintain capacity as there is insufficient circulatory carriageway to provide stacking space for waiting traffic. Removal of the roundabout to install conventional signals could lead to a significant increase in accidents at this junction, particularly during quieter traffic periods, as vehicles would be tempted to accelerate towards the signals rather than have to stop. The capacity of the junction is likely to be reduced by the provision of signals due to the need to introduce inter-green periods between signal phases to ensure traffic has time to clear the junction. A standard signal controlled junction would not be in keeping with adjacent junctions on the A1237 and could lead to driver uncertainty. The benefit of a signalised junction would be that traffic flows could be controlled with priority allocated to specific approach arms if required.

#### Proposal not considered to be value for money

26. A number of residents raised concerns about the value for money of the scheme. These comments were mainly suggesting that the scheme would not improve journey times in the area and that either the funds should be saved up to upgrade the A59 roundabout or to provide a dual carriageway. Some correspondents suggested that the funds would be better spent on alternative transport modes to reduce traffic levels.

#### Officers Response

27. Owing to the extent of the existing queuing which the scheme reduces significantly the benefits from the journey time savings is high. The cost of the improvements is relatively low meaning that the scheme is

considered to represent very good value for money when considered in accordance with the Department for Transport's methodology for evaluating schemes.

28. The improvements to the Outer Ring Road are part of the City Council's Local Transport Plan strategy which includes the promotion of sustainable transport modes. Increased capacity on the A1237 will reduce traffic through adjacent residential areas and enable the transfer of road space to bus and cycle routes.

#### Segregated Left Turn Lane would improve capacity

29. Many residents suggested that dedicated left turn lanes would enable turning traffic to avoid the roundabout entirely increasing the capacity of the junction. A number of the comments were accompanied by some very interesting sketches.

#### Officers Response

30. Dedicated left-turn slip roads could in principle improve the capacity of the roundabout but are not considered practical for this junction for a number of reasons. Conventional segregated slip roads and merge lanes are not permissible on single carriageway roads under current design standards. Left turn lanes with standard give way markings are permitted but there would be concerns on high flow routes such as the A1237/A19N movement and there would be limited advantage over the proposed layout.
31. There would be significant safety concerns to overcome if left turn lanes were proposed due high traffic speeds merging onto a single carriageway route. These could be addressed by the provision of a section of dual carriageway on the exit route but this would have to extend a considerable distance beyond the merge position to enable vehicles to join their destination route safely. Merge lanes raise particular safety concerns for cyclists which would be more expensive to overcome. Sufficient land within the public highway is not available to provide left turn lanes separate to the roundabout on any of the approaches.
32. Land outside the highway boundary is not available to the south of the A1237 due to the proximity of existing properties and a left turn lane from the A19 South would have to cross the Park & Ride entrance.

#### Pedestrian/cycling issues

33. A variety of pedestrian and cycling comments were received including suggestions that the route on the south side of the A1237 over the river should be improved and that the crossing points should be wide enough to accommodate tandems. Comments about the subway were also received ranging from requests to deal with the flooding to the suggestion that it should be converted for motorists to use. Other

comments relating to the possible provision of a signalised pedestrian/cyclist crossing of the P&R access were also received. Cyclists also identified that the outline proposal did not provide an at grade option when travelling north on the A19 cycle route and turning east along the A1237.

#### Officers Response

34. Unfortunately the majority of the comments relate to items which are outside the scope of this scheme. Providing a compliant cycle route over the Ouse and Railway line is a desirable aspiration but is not affordable within the budget for this scheme. However, it is proposed to extend the widened segregated cycle/pedestrian route to the access to the riverside path at the start of the bridge embankment. It is also proposed to fund improvement works to the subway pumping station as part of the scheme to ensure that it is more reliable. It does not appear that the traffic or pedestrian/cycling numbers warrant the provision of a signalised crossing to the Park & Ride Access and there are safety concerns about placing a controlled crossing close to the roundabout.
35. The design has been reviewed to address concerns that the original proposal did not provide an at grade crossing on the A1237 Westbound approach. It is just possible to fit in an island if the cycle/pedestrian route is adjusted to be on the east side of the subway. A narrow path is considered to be acceptable at this location due to the low anticipated usage.
36. The subway provides a safe crossing point for pedestrians and cyclists travelling between Skelton and the City. Approximately 200 people use the facility daily. Converting the route to provide a vehicular underpass whilst maintaining the pedestrian/cycling route is not practical.

#### Concerns about congestion on the A19 Northbound out of City/Exiting Manor Lane will be worse

37. A number of residents raised the issue of congestion on the A19 out of the city. These included suggestions that the traffic island at Manor Lane should be removed, the lane designation should be remarked and the approach to the roundabout should be widened to three lanes. Other residents were concerned that the exit from Manor Lane would be more difficult.

#### Officers Response

38. The outline scheme did not include any works on the A19 northbound approach because the transport modelling indicates that once the A59 and A19 roundabouts were upgraded outbound queuing would reduce substantially. The lanes are currently marked to even out the approach turning movements between the two lanes as much as possible. The turning counts suggest that at peak times the split between the left turn and straight ahead + right turn movements is closer to an even split than



a left turn + straight ahead and right turn arrangement. The provision of an additional lane at the roundabout is not considered practical due to the proximity of the Park & Ride entrance arm on the west side and the subway on the east side.

39. The traffic island on the A19 southern approach is provided to enable pedestrians/cyclists to safely cross and to protect the right turn lane into Manor Lane. Widening the road to accommodate two northbound lanes at this location could make the crossing less safe and would involve considerable diversion of services in the existing verges. In particular there area a number of BT chambers and fibre optic cables which would be prohibitively expensive to move.
40. It is not considered that the scheme will make the exit from Manor Lane more difficult as the layout of this arm of the roundabout is unaffected. It is anticipated that the increased capacity of the A19 roundabout when the A59 is also upgraded will shorten the queues on the A19 at this location. The provision of a widened approach to the junction into Manor Lane from the A19 is not considered justified as the speeds are relatively low off the roundabout and the visibility for vehicles exiting the junction may be hindered.

#### Concerns about affect on landscaped embankment

41. A number of residents have raised concerns about the removal of part of the environmental bund and associated vegetation on the A1237 westbound approach to the roundabout. The principle items raised relate to the concern that there will be increased noise and lighting disturbance. One resident was concerned that the land drainage in the area would be affected. In addition there is concern that the scheme will disturb the existing wildlife in the area.

#### Officers Response

42. To enable the carriageway to be widened to accommodate the new lanes within the highway boundary a section of the landscaping and embankment will need to be removed. The existing lighting at this location will be moved southwards and extended eastwards to cover the full length of the widened carriageway. Lights will be fully dark sky compliant and directed and baffled where necessary to avoid light pollution of adjacent properties.
43. Noise calculations indicate that the changes in noise levels due to the layout changes can be considered as minor. Changes to noise levels due to increases in speed and flow close to the roundabout increase the impact to moderate. The changes are within the level which is considered, by Planning Guidance, to be the minimum perceptible under normal conditions. The increase in noise levels in the adjacent properties will be reduced by the presence of the existing noise barrier. This fence will be extended where necessary to cover the full length of the widened carriageway. To ensure that an accurate baseline understanding of the

noise levels is available surveys are being undertaken in properties adjacent to the ring road prior to the removal of any vegetation. The removal of the existing rumble strips on the East approach to the roundabout is being considered which may also will reduce the noise levels at the adjacent properties.

44. The countryside officer has investigated the landscaped areas and considers that there is nothing of specific wildlife interest that would be affected by the proposals. The grass verges affected are re-sown species poor grasslands and the screening plantation is relatively new, though very well established, planting. This latter is of the most interest, primarily for birds but has a very limited ground flora as one would expect in a densely shaded area that has been established with herbicide treatment. With the opening up of this planting, the management needs of the whole of this section will be considered including thinning and coppicing. Also, the opportunity will be taken to begin to establish a more interesting ground flora and an appropriate woodland wildflower mix will be undersown to diversify the remaining areas. The removal of the trees and bushes must be timed to avoid the bird nesting season.

#### Concerns about closure of westbound Lay-by

45. A number of residents, the local councillors and the police have raised concerns about the proposed removal of the westbound lay-by on the A1237. This is considered to be a well used facility which needs to be re-provided.

#### Officers Response

46. Closure of the lay-by is essential to enable the safe operation of the merge lanes proposed on the exit to the roundabout. The original proposal was for the displaced vehicles to make use of the Park & Ride site however concerns were raised that the facility would not be available outside the Park & Ride operating hours. To take account of the concerns raised it is now proposed to provide a dedicated parking area in the Park & Ride extension car park. The existing height barrier will remain and a dedicated section of the car park will be gated/bollarded off. Access to the remainder of the car park for Park & Ride users would be opened when the extension car park was in operation. Subject to consultation with the Police Architectural Liaison Officer a path will be provided to connect the car park with the footway running along the south side of the A1237 so that access can be gained to the lngs. A minimum of 10 car park spaces will be provided.

#### Concerns about traffic speeds on roundabout

47. A number of users have raised the issue of traffic speeds on the roundabout making it more difficult to exit from the approaches and increasing the severity of any conflicts which occur.

#### Officers Response

48. The roundabout amendments have been designed in accordance with current design standards to encourage appropriate low speeds. It is anticipated that the provision of the additional traffic islands on the A1237 E & W and A19 N arms will deter drivers from excessive speeds on the approaches.

#### Concerns about queue lengths since previous upgrade

49. A number of comments were received with the view that queuing had not improved since the last changes to the roundabout in 2001.

#### Officers Response

50. The changes in 2001 doubled the diameter of roundabout and provided an additional access to the Park & Ride site. Traffic levels have increased substantially since then leading to some of the queuing which is currently experienced. From the traffic counters on the A1237 typical morning levels have increased by approximately 10% and evening levels by 40% at this location. It is estimated that the number of vehicles passing through the junction each day has increased from 43,000 to over 50,000 since 2001. Traffic levels at this key junction are projected to continue to rise.
51. One of the main reasons for the length of the queues at the roundabout is the lack of a free exit westbound at peak times due to capacity constraints at the A59 junction. This constraint will be reduced when the A59 roundabout is upgraded as part of the Access York Phase 1 project.

#### Concerns over access to Ings Cottages/House

52. The residents of the properties at Ings House/Cottages have expressed concern about the safety accessing their property. In particular despite the hatched markings on the A19 and ghost island provided for traffic turning into Ings House there are often overtaking vehicles approaching this location.

#### Officers Response

53. It is proposed to provide a traffic island at this location with pedestrian crossing facilities. This will ensure that the traffic from the north is constrained to a single lane and allow safer access/exit to Ings House. It will also provide an additional crossing point away from the roundabout for pedestrians/cyclists who want to use the subway. The island will be positioned to accommodate manoeuvres by large farm machinery.

#### Concerns about access/ exit to Rawcliffe Bar P&R

54. A number of comments were made about the access to the Park & Ride site and whether it could be made access only with the exit from the A19 signalised junction only.

## Officers Response

55. Any changes to the access/exit to the Park & Ride site would affect the operation of the service as car traffic would interfere with the bus operation. The road markings on the roundabout will direct traffic to the Park & Ride site more clearly. The main access and exit to the Park & Ride site will remain from the roundabout. Restricted access and exit is available from the signalised junction on the A19.

## Supportive of scheme

56. Supportive comments were received from 23 users of the roundabout.